



Neutrino Magnetic Moment–Mass Conundrum in the Light of Recent Experiments

Sudip Jana Max-Planck-Institut für Kernphysik

EuCAPT Astroneutrino Theory Workshop 2021 Prague, Czech Republic

Based on: arXiv: 2007.04291 [hep-ph], JHEP 10 (2020) 040



SJ



Muon magnetic moment



- Here, thousands of muons zip around an giant
 ~ 50 ft circular magnet at close to the speed of light.
- After making a few hundred laps in less than a millisecond, the muons decay and are soon replaced by another bunch.

• To understand the properties of muon: Specifically, to know about the muons' "magnetic moment"—

How much do they rotate on their axes in a powerful magnetic field— as they race around the magnet?



Neutrino magnetic moment







PC: XENON collaboration

Neutrino magnetic moments: experimental status

> The quest for measuring a possible magnetic moment of the neutrino was begun <u>even before the discovery of the neutrino</u>. Cowan, Reines and Harrison set an upper limit on in the process of measuring background for a free neutrino search experiment with reactor antineutrinos.

Reines was awarded the 1995 Nobel Prize in Physics for his codetection of the neutrino with Clyde Cowan in the neutrino experiment.



Frederick Reines

PHYSICAL REVIEW

VOLUME 96, NUMBER 5

DECEMBER 1, 1954

Upper Limit on the Neutrino Magnetic Moment*

C. L. COWAN, JR., F. REINES, AND F. B. HARRISON University of California, Los Alamos Scientific Laboratory, Los Alamos, New Mexico (Received August 18, 1954)

A liquid scintillation detector and neutrinos from a fission reactor were employed to set a new upper limit of 10⁻⁷ Bohr magneton for the neutrino magnetic moment.

Neutrino magnetic moments: experimental status



XENON Collaboration, E. Aprile et al. (2020)

Neutrino Magnetic Moments: from astrophysics and cosmology

Evolution of stars can provide indirect constraints on the magnetic moments.

Photons in the plasma of stellar environments **can decay** either into $v\bar{v}$ for the case of Dirac neutrinos or into $v_{\alpha}v_{\beta}$ for the case of Majorana neutrinos.

If such decays occur too rapidly, that would **drain energy of the star**, in conflict with standard stellar evolution models which appear to be on strong footing.

The best limit on $\mu\nu$ from this argument arises from red giant branch of globular clusters, resulting in a limit of $\mu_{\nu} < 4.5 \times 10^{-12} \mu_{B}$. Raffelt et al.(2013, 2021)

There are also cosmological limits arising from big bang nucleosynthesis. However, these limits are less severe, of order $10^{-10} \mu_B$. Fuller, Balantekin et al. (2015)

Background courtesy: NASA

Neutrino Magnetic Moments: from astrophysics and cosmology

Neutrino Trapping Mechanism

Evolution of stars can provide indirect constraints on the magnetic moments.

Photons in the plasma of stellar environments **can decay** either into $v\bar{v}$ for the case of Dirac neutrinos or into $v_{\alpha}v_{\beta}$ for the case of Majorana neutrinos.

If such decays occur too rapidly, that would **drain energy of the** star, in conflict with standard stellar evolution models which appear to be on strong footing.

The best limit on μ_v from this argument arises from red giant branch of globular clusters, resulting in a limit of

 $\mu_{v} < 4.5 \times 10^{-12} \,\mu_{B}$. Raffelt et al.(2013, 2021)

There are also cosmological limits arising from big bang nucleosynthesis. However, these limits are **less severe**, of order $10^{-10} \mu_B$. Fuller, Balantekin et al. (2015) We note that these indirect constraints from astrophysics may be evaded if the **plasmon decay to neutrinos is kinematically** forbidden.



• We closely follow the recent field theoretic evaluation of the **medium-dependent mass of the neutrino** in the presence of a light scalar that also couples to ordinary matter in illustrating our mechanism. Such interactions would provide the neutrino with a matter-dependent mass.

• Phenomenological implications of this scenario, including longrange force effects, were studied and phenomenological constraints from laboratory experiments, fifth force experiments, astrophysics and cosmology are analyzed. [Parke et al. (2018), Smirnov et al.(2019), Babu et al. (2019)]

Babu, SJ, Lindner (2020)

Background courtesy: NASA



In the absence of additional symmetries (and without severe fine-tuning) one would expect neutrino masses several orders of magnitude larger than their measured values., if $\mu_v \sim 10^{-11} \mu_B$

The main reason for this expectation is that the magnetic moment and the mass operators are **both chirality flipping**, which implies that by **removing the photon line** from the loop diagram that induces μ_v one would generate a **neutrino mass term**.

This would lead to the naive estimate of m_{ν} originating from such diagrams: $m_{\nu} \sim \frac{M^2 \mu_{\nu}}{2 m_e \mu_B} \sim 0.1 \text{ MeV}$ for M~100 GeV and $\mu_{\nu} \sim 10^{-11} \mu_B$



This magnetic moment-mass conundrum was well recognized three decades ago when there was great interest in explaining the apparent time variation of solar neutrino flux detected by the Chlorine experiment in anti-correlation with the Sun-spot activity.

Such a time variation could be explained if the neutrino has a $\mu_v \sim 10^{-10} \mu_B$ which would lead to spin-flip transition inside the solar magnetic field. Such transitions could even undergo a matter enhanced resonance. Lim, Marciano (1988), Akhmedov (1988)

In the late 1980's and early 1990's there were significant theoretical activities that addressed the compatibility of a large neutrino magnetic moment with a small mass.

After that, in the theory side, no interesting developments have been made. These discussions become very relevant today.

$SM + v_R$

The magnetic moment and mass operators for the neutrino have the same chiral structure, which for a Dirac neutrino has the form:



Bell, Cirigliano, Ramsey-Musolf, Vogel, and Wise (2005)

$SM + v_R$

The magnetic moment and mass operators for the neutrino have the same chiral structure, which for a Dirac neutrino has the form:

$$\mathcal{L} \supset \mu_{\nu} \overline{\nu}_L \sigma_{\mu\nu} \nu_R F^{\mu\nu} + m_{\nu} \overline{\nu}_L \nu_R + \text{H.c.}$$





Bell, Cirigliano, Ramsey-Musolf, Vogel, and Wise (2005)

Left-Right Symmetric Model

In left-right symmetric models, the right-handed neutrino couples to a W_R gauge boson, which also has mixing with the W boson:



This mixing angle is constrained by muon decay asymmetry parameters, as well as by $b \rightarrow s\gamma$ decay rate, indirect LHC limits leading to a limit

$$\mu_v < 10^{-15} \mu_l$$

Czakon, Gluza, Zralek (1999) Giunti and A. Studenikin (2014)

$SM + v_R$

The magnetic moment and mass operators for the neutrino have the same chiral structure, which for a Dirac neutrino has the form:





$$\mu_{\nu}^{SM} \sim 10^{-20} \ \mu_B$$

K. Fujikawa and R. Shrock (1980)

Bell, Cirigliano, Ramsey-Musolf, Vogel, and Wise (2005)

Supersymmetric theory

In supersymmetric extensions of the SM, lepton number may be violated by R-parity breaking interactions. In such contexts, without relying on additional symmetries, the neutrino transition magnetic moment will be (imposing experimental constraints on the SUSY parameters) of the order at most about $10^{-15}\ \mu_B$.

$$\mu_{\nu} \sim \lambda'^2/(16\pi^2) m_{\ell}^2 A_{\ell}/M_{\tilde{\ell}}^4$$

Left-Right Symmetric Model

In left-right symmetric models, the right-handed neutrino couples to a W_R gauge boson, which also has mixing with the W boson:



This mixing angle is constrained by muon decay asymmetry parameters, as well as by $b \rightarrow s\gamma$ decay rate, indirect LHC limits leading to a limit

 $\mu_{v} < 10^{-15} \mu_{B}$

Czakon, Gluza, Zralek (1999) Giunti and A. Studenikin (2014)

$SM + v_R$

The magnetic moment and mass operators for the neutrino have the same chiral structure, which for a Dirac neutrino has the form:



$$\mu_{\nu}^{SM} \sim 10^{-20} \ \mu_B$$

K. Fujikawa and R. Shrock (1980)

Bell, Cirigliano, Ramsey-Musolf, Vogel, and Wise (2005)

Supersymmetric theory

In supersymmetric extensions of the SM, lepton number may be violated by R-parity breaking interactions. In such contexts, without relying on additional symmetries, the neutrino transition magnetic moment will be (imposing experimental constraints on the SUSY

parameters) of the order at most about $10^{\text{-15}} \; \mu_B$.

$$\mu_{\nu} \sim \lambda'^2 / (16\pi^2) m_{\ell}^2 A_{\ell} / M_{\tilde{\ell}}^4$$

Left-Right Symmetric Model

In left-right symmetric models, the right-handed neutrino couples to a W_R gauge boson, which also has mixing with the W boson:



This mixing angle is constrained by muon decay asymmetry parameters, as well as by $b \rightarrow sy$ decay rate, indirect LHC limits leading to a limit

 $\mu_v < 10^{-15} \mu_B$

Czakon, Gluza, Zralek (1999) Giunti and A. Studenikin (2014)

Majorana scenario

If neutrinos are Majorana particles, their transition magnetic moments resulting from Standard Model interactions is given by

$$\mu_{ij} = -\frac{3eG_F}{32\sqrt{2}\pi^2} (m_i \pm m_j) \sum_{\ell=e,\mu,\tau} U_{\ell i}^* U_{\ell j} \frac{m_{\ell}^2}{m_W^2}$$

The resulting transition magnetic moment is even smaller than the previous estimate: at most of order $\mu_v \sim 10^{-23} \mu_B$

P. B. Pal and L. Wolfenstein (1982)

$SM + v_R$

The magnetic moment and mass operators for the neutrino have the same chiral structure, which for a Dirac neutrino has the form:

$$u_{\nu} = \frac{eG_F m_{\nu}}{8\sqrt{2}\pi^2} = 3 \times 10^{-20} \mu_B \left(\frac{m_{\nu}}{0.1 \text{ eV}}\right)$$



 $\mu_{\nu}^{SM} \sim 10^{-20} \ \mu_B$

K. Fujikawa and R. Shrock (1980) Bell, Cirigliano, Ramsey-Musolf, Vogel, and Wise (2005)

Supersymmetric theory

In supersymmetric extensions of the SM, lepton number may be violated by R-parity breaking interactions. In such contexts, without relying on additional symmetries, the neutrino transition magnetic moment will be (imposing experimental constraints on the SUSY parameters) of the order at most about $10^{-15}\ \mu_B$.

$$\mu_{\nu} \sim \lambda'^2 / (16\pi^2) m_{\ell}^2 A_{\ell} / M_{\tilde{\ell}}^4$$

Left-Right Symmetric Model

In left-right symmetric models, the right-handed neutrino couples to a W_R gauge boson, which also has mixing with the W boson:



This mixing angle is constrained by muon decay asymmetry parameters, as well as by $b \rightarrow s\gamma$ decay rate, indirect LHC limits leading to a limit

 $\mu_{\nu} < 10^{-15} \mu_B$

Czakon, Gluza, Zralek (1999) Giunti and A. Studenikin (2014)

Majorana scenario

If neutrinos are Majorana particles, their transition magnetic moments resulting from Standard Model interactions is given by

$$\mu_{ij} = -\frac{3eG_F}{32\sqrt{2}\pi^2} (m_i \pm m_j) \sum_{\ell=e,\mu,\tau} U_{\ell i}^* U_{\ell j} \frac{m_{\ell}^2}{m_W^2}$$

The resulting transition magnetic moment is even smaller than the previous estimate: at most of order $\mu_v \sim 10^{-23} \mu_B$

P. B. Pal and L. Wolfenstein (1982)

Clearly, these values are well below the sensitivity of current experiments!

A. Spin Symmetry Mechanism



Barr, Freire, and Zee (1990), Babu et al. (1992), Babu, **SJ**, Lindner (2020)

B. $SU(2)_H$ Symmetry for Enhanced Neutrino Magnetic Moment

ν_α e e e e

While the neutrino mass operator and the magnetic moment operator both **are chirality flipping**, there is one important **difference in their Lorentz structures**.

The mass operator, being a Lorentz scalar, is symmetric, while the magnetic moment, being a Lorentz tensor operator is antisymmetric in the two fermion fields.

In 1988, Voloshin proposed a new SU(2), symmetry that transforms v into v^c.

A neutrino mass term, being symmetric under this exchange, would then be forbidden by the $SU(2)_{\nu}$ symmetry, while the magnetic moment operator, $\nu^T C\sigma_{\mu\nu} \nu^c F^{\mu\nu}$ is antisymmetric under the exchange.

1989: Barbieri and R. N. Mohapatra pointed out that its hard to implement the Voloshin symmetry since it does not commute with SM.

$$\mathcal{L}_{\text{mag.}} = (\nu_e^T \quad \nu_\mu^T) C^{-1} \sigma_{\mu\nu} \begin{pmatrix} 0 & 1 \\ -1 & 0 \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} \nu_e \\ \nu_\mu \end{pmatrix} F^{\mu\nu}$$
$$\mathcal{L}_{\text{mass}} = (\nu_e^T \quad \nu_\mu^T) C^{-1} \begin{pmatrix} 0 & 1 \\ 1 & 0 \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} \nu_e \\ \nu_\mu \end{pmatrix}$$

Voloshin (1988) Babu, Mohapatra (1989) Babu, **SJ**, Lindner (2020)

B. $SU(2)_H$ Symmetry for Enhanced Neutrino Magnetic Moment



A horizontal symmetry acting on the electron and the muon families can serve the same purpose, which is easier to implement as such a symmetry commutes with the weak interactions.

Our simplification is that the symmetry is only approximate, broken explicitly by electron and muon masses.

The explicit breaking of $SU(2)_H$ by the lepton masses is **analogous to** chiral symmetry breaking in the strong interaction sector by masses of the light quarks.

 $SU(2)_H$ cannot be exact, as it would imply $m_e = m_{\mu}$. We propose to include explicit but small breaking of $SU(2)_H$, so that realistic electron and muon masses can be generated.

We have computed the one-loop corrections to the neutrino mass from these explicit breaking terms and found them to small enough so as to not upset the large magnetic moment solution. Leptons of the Standard Model transform under $SU(2)_L \times U(1)_Y \times SU(2)_H$ as follows:

$$\psi_L = \begin{pmatrix} \nu_e & \nu_\mu \\ e & \mu \end{pmatrix}_L \quad (2, -\frac{1}{2}, 2)$$

$$\psi_R = (e & \mu)_R \quad (1, -1, 2)$$

$$\psi_{3L} = \begin{pmatrix} \nu_\tau \\ \tau \end{pmatrix} \quad (2, -\frac{1}{2}, 1)$$

$$\tau_R \quad (1, -1, 1)$$

Higgs sector:

$$\phi_{S} = \begin{pmatrix} \phi_{S}^{+} \\ \phi_{S}^{0} \end{pmatrix} \qquad (2, \frac{1}{2}, 1)$$

$$\Phi = \begin{pmatrix} \phi_{1}^{+} & \phi_{2}^{+} \\ \phi_{1}^{0} & \phi_{2}^{0} \end{pmatrix} \qquad (2, \frac{1}{2}, 2)$$

$$\eta = (\eta_{1}^{+} & \eta_{2}^{+}) \qquad (1, 1, 2) .$$

 $\mathcal{L}_{\text{Yuk}} = h_1 \operatorname{Tr} \left(\bar{\psi}_L \phi_S \psi_R \right) + h_2 \bar{\psi}_{3L} \phi_S \tau_R + h_3 \bar{\psi}_{3L} \Phi i \tau_2 \psi_R^T$ $+ f \eta \tau_2 \psi_L^T \tau_2 C \psi_{3L} + f' \operatorname{Tr} \left(\bar{\psi}_L \Phi \right) \tau_R + H.c.$

> Here $SU(2)_H$ acts horizontally, while $SU(2)_L$ acts vertically.

B. $SU(2)_H$ Symmetry for Enhanced Neutrino Magnetic Moment

- ★ The Lagrangian of the model does not respect lepton number. The SU(2)_H limit of the model however respects $L_e - L_\mu$ symmetry. This allows a nonzero transition magnetic moment, while neutrino mass terms are forbidden.
- ★ Feynman diagrams generating neutrino transition magnetic moment in the SU(2)_H model. There are additional diagrams where the photon is emitted from the τ lepton line. The same diagrams with the photon line removed would contribute to Majorana mass of the neutrino.
- ★ In the $SU(2)_H$ symmetric limit, the two diagrams add for $\mu_{vev\mu}$, while they cancel for m_v .

$$\mu_{\nu_e\nu_{\mu}} = \frac{ff'}{8\pi^2} m_{\tau} \sin 2\alpha \left[\frac{1}{m_{h^+}^2} \left\{ \ln \frac{m_{h^+}^2}{m_{\tau}^2} - 1 \right\} - \frac{1}{m_{H^+}^2} \left\{ \ln \frac{m_{H^+}^2}{m_{\tau}^2} - 1 \right\} \right]$$







Neutrino Magnetic Moment



Neutrino Magnetic Moment



Muon g-2: experimental status



After Fermilab muon g-2 announcement:



Muon and Neutrino Magnetic Moments in the SM



→ Due to quantum corrections, $(g-2)_{\mu} \neq 0$.

Anomalous Magnetic Moment:
$$a_{\mu} = \frac{(g-2)_{\mu}}{2}$$



Contribution	Value (x10 ⁻¹¹)
QED	116,584,718.931±.104
Weak force	153.6±1.0
Hadronic vacuum polarization (dispersive)	6,845±40
NOT USED (Lattice hadronic vacuum polarization)	7116±184
Hadronic light-by-light (dispersive+lattice)	92±18
Total Standard Model Value	116,591,810±43
Difference from 2001 experiment	279±76

No neutrino magnetic moments in the SM!







Babu, SJ, Lindner, Kovilakam (2021)





A direct correlation between the neutrino magnetic moment and muon g-2

LFV coupling without Lepton flavor violation

Outside chirality flipping

Sign and strength are automatic here, no control over it.

A minimal unified framework for three different components: μ_v , m_v , muon g-2



Babu, SJ, Lindner, Kovilakam (2021)



A direct correlation between the neutrino magnetic moment and muon g-2

LFV coupling without Lepton flavor violation

Outside chirality flipping

Sign and strength are automatic here, no control over it.

A minimal unified framework for three different components: μ_v , m_v , muon g-2

Testable at the upcoming run of LHC



Babu, SJ, Lindner, Kovilakam (2021)



A direct correlation between the neutrino magnetic moment and muon g-2

LFV coupling without Lepton flavor violation

Outside chirality flipping

Sign and strength are automatic here, no control over it.

A minimal unified framework for three different components: Large μ_v , m_v , muon g-2



Babu, SJ, Lindner, Kovilakam (2021)



SUDIP JANA | MPIK



SUDIP JANA | MPIK